

NCB-ESA Professional Award Committee Report

March 17, 2019

Scott Williams, Chair

1. Committee members

| | | |
|-----------------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|
| Scott B. Williams (Chair), | term ends 2020, | (scott.williams@dtm.com) |
| Kayla Perry, | term ends 2022, | (jtkp8b@mail.missouri.edu) |
| Justin McMechan, | term ends 2021, | (justin.mcmechan@unl.edu) |
| Janet Knodel, | term ends 2021, | (janet.knodel@nds.u.edu) |
| Marlin Rice, | term ends 2021, | (marlin.rice@pioneer.com) |
| Aleksandra Dolezal (Student Rep), | term ends 2022, | (adolezal@uoguelph.ca) |

2. Key accomplishments

Award winner evaluation completed and winner names, nominator information, and evaluation spreadsheet were forwarded to Drs. Ravlin and Pilcher.

| | |
|--|---------------|
| Award of Excellence in Integrated Pest Management: | 2 nominations |
| Distinguished Achievement Award in Extension: | 4 nominations |
| Legacy Contribution Award: | 1 nomination |
| Excellence in Early Career Award: | 2 nominations |

Zero nominations received for:

Distinguished Achievement Award in Teaching

3. Tasks carried out

1/14/2019- Award winner names and evaluation spreadsheet forwarded to Drs. Ravlin and Pilcher

1/7/2019- Final selection of award recipients approved by the Professional Awards Committee.

1/4/2019- Final reminder for judges to submit their evaluations to Williams

12/20/2018- Reminder sent to judges to continue evaluating nominations.

12/10/2018- Access to nomination packets granted to Professional Awards judges by Cindy Myers.

12/7/2018- Nomination period closes

10/11/2018- Awards nomination period opens; Professional Awards Committee judges contacted, finalized.

10/9/2018- Professional Awards Committee members contacted or appointed.

10/4-10/9/2018- Edits and improvements made on awards website.

10/3/2018- Language approved for new Legacy Contribution Award.

5/9/2018- Tom Hunt sends NCB Operating Guidelines manual to Williams.

5/7/2018- Andy Michel contacts Scott Williams to be Professional Awards committee chair. Williams accepts.

4. Challenges encountered

- *Problems submitting nominations:* There were a few technical issues regarding the submission of nominations. Some nominators did not receive confirmation e-mails on their first attempt in submitting a packet. Eventually, packets were received by committee chair and confirmation e-mails were received by nominators.
- *Few or zero nominations for some categories:* The Legacy Contribution Award received only one nomination and the Excellence in Teaching Award received zero nominations.

- *Criteria confusion:* What seems like a perennial problem, there seems to be some confusion regarding the division of points for scoring nominees' packets. Criteria either unclear as to whether certain subcategories add up to a larger category or are separate, distinct values.

5. Recommendations for improvement

- *Problems submitting nomination:* It would probably be useful 2-3 weeks out from the awards deadline to submit dummy nomination packages to determine if technical issues exist before accepting real nominations.
- *Few or zero nominations for some categories:* With the exceptions noted above, most awards received two or more nominations, which is an improvement over last year. The Legacy Contribution award likely suffered from being so new and the teaching award suffered from a lack of nominees. One suggestion to encourage more applications is a webinar or similar informative event to explain the awards to the NCB-ESA membership as I believe most people are unfamiliar with what awards are available and their criteria. I believe it'd also help to have a more robust media campaign (twitter, facebook, etc) to encourage submissions.
- *Criteria confusion:* Between now and next year, we should review the award selection criteria and formally identify those points of error and confusion. Re-formatting the way the criteria is presented on the website and other sources should also help reduce confusion.

Professional Awards Committee 2019 Report

Professional Awards Committee

Scott B. Williams, PhD.- Committee Chair

Kayla Perry, PhD.- Committee Member

Justin McMechan, PhD.- Committee Member

Janet Knodel, PhD.- Committee Member

Marlin Rice, PhD.- Committee Member

Aleksandra Dolezal- Student Representative

Purpose: To select the recipients of the 2019 NCB-ESA Branch Professional Awards.

Nominations

Award of Excellence in Integrated Pest Management (**2 nominations**)

- Robert Koch, University of Minnesota
- Chris Ranger, USDA-ARS

Distinguished Achievement Award in Extension (**4 nominations**)

- Dr. Susan Jones, The Ohio State University
- Dr. Cliff Sadof, Purdue University
- Dr. Stephen Kells, University of Minnesota
- Dr. Christelle N. Guédot, University of Wisconsin

Distinguished Achievement Award in Teaching (**0 nominations**)

Legacy Contribution Award (**1 nomination**)

- Kun Yan Zhu, Kansas State University

Excellence in Early Career Award (**2 nominations**)

- Adam Varenhorst, South Dakota State University
- William “Rob” Morrison, USDA-ARS

Selection Process

The Professional Awards Committee wishes, first and foremost, to acknowledge that we received a number of strong nominations for the awards listed above. This made selection a challenge, but in the end, we believe we came to a fair consensus as to who we believe should be recognized in each category.

Part of the challenge in selecting a consensus recipient this year was that two of the judges had conflicts of interest with some of the nominees. In the past, final recipients were selected based on whichever nominee had the highest combined total or average score. This selection criteria could not be fairly applied, though, with reviewers being unable to evaluate specific nominees. This would have led to nominees having unfairly low scores (combined total) or high scores (average), depending on how each committee member performed their evaluations.

To resolve this issue, the committee performed their evaluations and then a rank-choice system was applied. Each nominee was assigned a rank according to the corresponding reviewer's score. Nominee's with the highest score from a particular reviewer were assigned a Rank of 1, next highest a Rank of 2, and so on. Nominees with a clear majority of Rank 1 assignments were declared the consensus winner. In cases for which no nominee received a clear majority, the nominee with the fewest votes had their vote total reassigned to the corresponding reviewer's Rank 2 choice. This process was repeated until a nominee either had a clear majority or two nominees tied.

In the event of a tie, the average score of each candidate was compared. The candidate with the highest score was selected as the recipient.

The committee unanimously approved the selection of this year's recipients through e-mail correspondence.

Vote totals

Award of Excellence in Integrated Pest Management

- Dr. Robert Koch, University of Minnesota **(4 votes)**
- Dr. Chris Ranger, USDA-ARS **(2 votes)**

Distinguished Achievement Award in Extension **(After 2 rounds of voting)**

- Dr. Susan Jones, The Ohio State University **(3 votes)**
- Dr. Cliff Sadof, Purdue University **(3 votes)**
- Dr. Stephen Kells, University of Minnesota **(0 votes)**
- Dr. Christelle N. Guédot, University of Wisconsin **(0 votes)**

| Reviewer preferences based on scores (1 = first preference, 2 = second preference, etc.) | | | | |
|--|-------|-------|-------|--------|
| | Jones | Sadof | Kells | Geudot |
| Judge 1 | -- | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| Judge 2 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 4 |
| Judge 3 | 1 | 3 | 2 | 4 |
| Judge 4 | 1 | 2 | 4 | 3 |
| Judge 5 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 1 |
| Judge 6 | 1 | 4 | 3 | 2 |

| Results of rank-choice votes | | | | |
|------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|--------|
| Round | Jones | Sadof | Kells | Geudot |
| 1 | 3 | 2 | 0 | 1 |
| 2 | 3 | 3 | - | - |

Distinguished Achievement Award in Teaching

Legacy Contribution Award

- Dr. Kun Yan Zhu, Kansas State University (***Unanimous***)

Excellence in Early Career Award

- Dr. Adam Varenhorst, South Dakota State University
- Dr. William "Rob" Morrison, USDA-ARS (***Unanimous***)

Final Award Recipients

| Award | Recipient |
|---|--|
| Award of Excellence in Integrated Pest Management | Dr. Robert Koch, University of Minnesota |
| Distinguished Achievement Award in Extension | Dr. Susan Jones, The Ohio State University |
| Distinguished Achievement Award in Teaching | None |
| Legacy Contribution Award | Dr. Kun Yan Zhu, Kansas State University |
| Excellence in Early Career Award | Dr. William "Rob" Morrison, USDA-ARS |